Reviewer's report

Title: ST3Gal.I sialyltransferase relevance in bladder cancer tissues and cell lines

Version: 1 Date: 10 August 2009

Reviewer: madhu dikshit

Reviewer's report:

Reviewers Report:
a) Discretionary Revisions:
1) Figures can be reorganized making them more compact and specific.
b) Minor Essential Revisions:
1) The use of “commas” instead of “decimals” in the data provided should be changed.
2) Figure one does not have mention of proper significance sign.
3) Figure 6B can be labeled more properly
c) Major Compulsory Revisions: :
1) Enzyme activity assay for sialyltransferase is for all the isoforms. It will be improper to interpret results only with respect to ST3Gal.I activity. Increased expression does not always mean increased activity.
2) Evidence for sialyl T antigen is also indirect and no direct sialyltion of T antigen is shown by the investigated isoforms and therefore the conclusion by the authors that ST3Gal.I plays the major role in the sialylation of the T antigen in bladder cancer is hypothetical without any direct evidence.
3) Correlating various cell line data with the patient samples is not fully assertive. It would have been better if the workers would have done primary cell culture from the diseased and control samples to test their hypothesis.
4) The manuscript is not well written and figures are not numbered properly and difficult to follow. Example in figure 1 there are three separate graphs but the authors have not marked them a, b and c. This makes difficult to follow the results figure wise.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.
Declaration of competing interests:

None