Reviewer's report

Title: The association between RCAS1 expression in laryngeal and pharyngeal cancer and its healthy stroma with cancer relapse

Version: 1 Date: 21 November 2008

Reviewer: Munechika Enjoji

Reviewer's report:

Authors examined the RCAS1 expression in laryngeal and pharyngeal cancers and investigated its clinical availability for predicting recurrence, prognosis, and so on. The study is really significant. If their presentation and explanation are improved in some points, this article becomes more persuasive.

Comments

1. Fig. 1 (Western blot): There was no heading for each column. Therefore, we cannot evaluate the result. Please supply.

2. Results (page 9, line 15): in all (96,5%) samples # in almost all (96.5%) samples.

3. Table 3-7: In this style, expression levels seem not to be quantitative. The expression levels of RCAS1 (Western blot) should be shown as the RCAS1/#-actin ratio.

4. Table 5, 6: Show the data in clear surgical margin. The results are more important, I think.

5. Results (page 11, line 9): Authors said “RCAS1 immunoreactivity was observed to decrease in accordance with the distance from the tumor”. However, no data were presented at least in the RESULTS. Fig. 4 may represent the sentence, but it may be only one specific case.

6. Fig. 4 (immunostaining): Which side is cancer-side? Please write down.

7. Fig. 5 is not mentioned in the text.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
'I declare that I have no competing interests'