Reviewer's report

**Title:** Pediatric differentiated thyroid carcinoma in TNM stage I: risk factor analysis for disease free survival

**Version:** 2  **Date:** 25 March 2009

**Reviewer:** Ashok R Shaha

**Reviewer's report:**

All are minor essential revisions:

This is the experience on one institution with pediatric differentiated thyroid carcinoma over a period of 42 years, with 57 patients presenting with stage I disease.

1. The title includes the words “TNM”, which may be deleted.
2. The series extends over a long period of time with considerable developments in diagnostic ability, evaluation and the management of pediatric thyroid cancer. The philosophy of the extent of thyroidectomy, radioactive iodine and external radiation therapy has evolved during this time.
3. The authors have 11 patients with follicular carcinoma of the thyroid. It is quite likely that, since this incidence appears to be quite high, some of these patients may have had a follicular variant of papillary thyroid carcinoma.
4. The authors have reported local recurrence, which may be difficult to interpret since it could mean either local or regional recurrence.
5. Radioactive iodine treatment was used in only 10 patients. Generally, in the pediatric thyroid cancer group, radioactive iodine is used in a much higher percentage of patients.
6. In the abstract conclusion the authors have written “aggressive treatment should be considered for appropriate patients”. It is unclear what the authors mean by aggressive treatment.
7. The overall size of the tumor reported is 4.3 cm, which is probably much larger than usually encountered in pediatric thyroid cancer.
8. The authors have reported some experience with fine needle aspiration biopsy and suspected follicular thyroid carcinoma, which is not a common experience with FNA.
9. The subtotal thyroidectomy reported is unclear to this reviewer. Clearly, the time frame of this manuscript is quite large, however generally subtotal thyroidectomy is not a recommendation in suspected thyroid cancer.

This is an interesting manuscript with a critical analysis of prognostic factors.

**Level of interest:** An article of importance in its field
Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.