Reviewer's report

Title: Malignant transformation of oral potentially malignant disorders: a retrospective cohort study

Version: 3 Date: 21 November 2008

Reviewer: Meir Gorsky

Reviewer's report:

Malignant transformation of oral potentially malignant disorders: a retrospective cohort study

Major Compulsory Revisions
This is an interesting study however it is, unfortunately, poorly presented:

1. Too many authors for such study.
2. Generally too old references.
3. Poor English editing.

Background

4. I suggest that the authors should refer to newer studies for their references.
5. Ref. 14 refers to Oral Lichen Planus rather than to Oral Submucous Fibrosis.
6. Ref. 16 is incorrect.
7. Studies referred to as 6,7 are not Lumeman's !!
8. In the second paragraph ref. do not refer to Napier and Speight.

Materials

10. Leukoplakia is a clinical term prior to performing histological examination. Therefore, it is wrong using the terms "leukoplakia with dysplasia". A better term would be "dysplastic hyperkeratosis", "clinical white lesion diagnosed as dysplasia" or something similar.
11. Wrong way of citing papers in the reference.

Results

12. Follow up of 38 months seems too short since transformation leukoplakia may take over mean of 7 years. (Ref. 4)
13. No need to repeat Table 1 in the text.
14. I suggest to start table 2 with "malignant transformation" and than "rate of transformation".

Discussion
15. Poor discussion.
16. Ref. 4 is not Schepman's study, Ref. 21 is not Bouquot's !!

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
'I declare that I have no competing interests'