Reviewer's report

Title: The prosurvival role of autophagy in Resveratrol-induced cytotoxicity in human U251 glioma cells

Version: 1 Date: 24 February 2009

Reviewer: Carmem Gottfried

Reviewer's report:

MANUSCRIPT ID: 7211904142428172
TITLE: THE PROSURVIVAL ROLE OF AUTOPHAGY IN RESVERATROL-INDUCED CYTOTOXICITY IN HUMAN U251 GLIOMA CELLS

The authors investigated the involvement of autophagy in the resveratrol-induced apoptotic death of human U251 glioma cells. The aim of the manuscript is clear. Also, the references cited in the introduction are adequate to understanding the subject. The results are consistent and the discussion is well conducted. In my opinion, this manuscript can be accepted to be published in BMC Cancer with few modifications indicated bellow.

1. Abstract section: avoid unnecessary symbols e.g. use “51.29#0.64%” instead of “51.29%#0.64%”

2. Please, separate numbers from units through the text (e.g. “72h” and “0.5ug/ml” in Apoptosis detection assay at page 6).

3. Check errors. e.g. “37#” at pages 4, 6, 7…

4. The statistical evaluation for the results should be performed by one way ANOVA.

5. Discussion section (page 12, line 12): I suggest to use “In addition, Res induces growth...”. It is not necessary to mention the name of the researcher if it is the same from ref 42.

6. Autophagy has been suggested as a possible mechanism for non-apoptotic death. What the authors explain the sentence at the Discussion section (page 14, last paragraph): “Apoptosis is an important cause of death of U251 cells, while autophagy delays apoptosis and protect cells from death”. How could autophagy protect cells from death if it induce cell death?

7. Add a scale bar at figures 2 and 4.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field
Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests