Reviewer's report

Title: Diffusion-weighted imaging: a valuable aid for the evaluation of the tumor aggressiveness in breast carcinoma

Version: 3 Date: 26 September 2008

Reviewer: Kayvan Najarian

Reviewer's report:

While the main issue raised by Reviewer 2 regarding the need to verify the results of the method with histology specimen is a very reasonable comment, I do not believe that the paper must be rejected because of the absence of such comparison. Reviewer 2’s comment is an important point and must be properly addressed, as I will discuss below; however, if the methodology proposed by the paper can create a useful novel approach, the paper must be at least published as a Short report or work-in-progress.

At the same time, authors must realize that, as Reviewer 2 stated, in almost all cancer diagnostic procedures, histological specimen are still the gold standard in determining the degree of "aggressiveness" for any type of tumor. As such, the authors need to be very cautious in making "strong" claims regarding their methods before quantitatively comparing the method with the pathology reports on histological specimen on a large-scale study.

My suggestion is that the authors "tone down" the paper - instead of making strong claims regarding this potentially interesting methodology, only discuss the promising results and try to compare the results with histology results (if possible), revise the title of the paper, and resubmit. If the comparison with histology cannot be made for this paper, I suggest that the paper may be more suitable for publication as a Short report.