Reviewer's report

Title: Diffusion-weighted imaging: a valuable aid for the determination of the margin of breast carcinoma

Version: 2 Date: 28 February 2008

Reviewer: Isabel Rubio

Reviewer's report:

I want to congratulate the authors for the study. I have some comments to it:

On the materials and methods almost half of the patients had a benign breast lesion, I consider that probably they could biopsy it instead of doing surgical excision because for the study they only need the histology, except for the margin evaluation but this is only need in malignant lesions. Could this study be done using just MRI guided biopsies?

How difficult is to read the DWI? Does any of the patients need a re-excision because they had less than 10mm of margin and it was positive?

In the conclusion the authors report that 10 mm away from the margin in routine MRI could be regard as a safe margin for excision. Have they measure the pathologic margins and compare it with the margins in the MRI? Have the authors compared the size of the tumor by MRI and by histology and see the correspondence?

I am sure that the DWI will provide more information on the field of breast conservative surgery although I think that the comparisons between the results of the MRI and the histology should be clarified.

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests