Reviewer's report

Title: Polymorphism +17 C/G in Matrix Metalloprotease MMP8 decreases lung cancer risk

Version: 1 Date: 25 July 2008

Reviewer: Jianhui Zhang

Reviewer's report:

Generally the manuscript is well organized, however, I suggest the following major revisions before it can be accepted:

1. The author should indicate more detail about the method of matching controls for the study. Specifically, the exclusion criteria for the 194 cases should be addressed in detail to avoid the selection bias;

2. The author should explain if all lung cancer patients during the study time period have been recruited from the two hospital, if not, what is the rate of recruitment. In addition, what is the “eligible cases” and “eligible controls” mentioned and what is the criteria for eligibility;

3. The family history of cancer should be detailed defined, i.e., how many generation pedigree has been assessed for determining the history;

4. The association between the polymorphisms and survival time should take treatment method into consideration. Different treatment definitely will influence the survival time even with the similar clinical stages and metastases;

5. The author should try to observe the interactive effects between the polymorphisms in the susceptibility and clinical characteristics;

6. The introduction is too redundant and need to be make concisely;

7. The subtitles should be kept consistency in the part of Results, only one subtitle is inappropriate.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.