Reviewer’s report

Title: Incidence, Mortality Patterns and 5-year Relative Survival Ratio of Prostate Cancer among Residents in Singapore from 1968 to 2002

Version: 6 Date: 15 September 2008

Reviewer: Matthew R Cooperberg

Reviewer’s report:

Minor essential revisions

1. [intro / discussion] Two different ASRs are quoted for the United States: 124 in the intro and 118 in the discussion. I believe the latter is correct from the 2002 GLOBOCON data.

2. [discussion] I would ask once more that the authors address more explicitly the finding that prostate cancer incidence in 3-fold higher in India than in China, but incidence and mortality are much higher among Chinese than Indians in Singapore. The discussion of diet hints at this, but not well enough.

Discretionary revisions

1. [intro / methods] The cumulative lifetime risk of prostate cancer for men in Singapore would be a relevant adjunct statistic to report along with the ASR, if this can be calculated readily from the data.

2. [intro] The decline in prostate cancer mortality in the United States has been ongoing since 1990, which most would agree is too soon into the PSA era for the decline to be attributable to screening, though perhaps the ongoing decline more recently could be in part attributable to screening.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests