Reviewer's report

Title: Dietary Preference, Physical Activity, and Cancer Risk in Men: National Health Insurance Corporation Study

Version: 1 Date: 12 June 2008

Reviewer: Sabine Rohrmann

Reviewer's report:

The authors aim to examine in a large cohort whether dietary preference for a plant or meat based diet affects the risk of cancer in men.

While the topic of the manuscript is interesting and important, the study has some major limitations.

Abstract: The maximum length of an abstract for BMC cancer is 350 words. The authors should used this for an informative abstract. Especially the methods section can be improved. It is not clear how many cancer cases were included in the study.

Methods, page 6: The description of the dietary assessment method is insufficient. It is not clear which foods were used to categorize the subjects. It is also unclear how vegetable preference, mixed vegetables, and meat preference were defined. For example, are subjects with vegetable preference only vegetarians?

Results: The effect for total mortality is mainly based on the increased risk for lung cancer. For lung cancer, adjusting for smoking is crucial. The authors only adjusted for smoking status (never, former, current) and did not take into account pack-years of smoking, or smoking dose and duration separately. So, there likely is residual confounding by smoking.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.