Reviewer’s report

Title: Infrequent cyclooxygenase-2 overexpression in serrated colorectal polyps

Version: 1 Date: 3 October 2007

Reviewer: Sanford SM Markowitz

Reviewer’s report:

General
Kawasaki et al.
Infrequent cyclooxygenase-2 overexpression in serrated COX-2 in serrated colorectal polyps.

This is a straightforward immunohistochemical study of COX-2 expression in serrated versus non-serrated lesions. The findings make quite clear the induction of COX-2 occurs at the stage of serrated adenomas, but not in lesions that are earlier in the serrated pathway, such as in sessile serrated polyps or mixed polyps or sessile serrated adenomas. The study is comprehensive and the largest of its kind, which is important as even in this large study these early serrated lesions proved to be in shorter supply than the later lesions. Overall the study will be of value to the field and will be read with interest.

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

This reviewer has only one issue with the paper, which is that the title is misleading. As the authors' introduction states, serrated polyps usually include the class of serrated adenomas. In serrated adenomas the authors found the same level of COX-2 over-expression as they did in tubular adenomas. To many readers, who may only skim the title of the study, the exact opposite conclusion will be communicated. The authors should consider changing the title to something akin to:

“COX-2 overexpression characterizes late but not early serrated colorectal neoplasias.”

Or some other title that more accurately represents the findings of the study.

----------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

----------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)
What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.