Reviewer's report

Title: Infrequent cyclooxygenase-2 overexpression in serrated colorectal polyps

Version: 1  Date: 19 September 2007

Reviewer: Kenichi Sugihara

Reviewer's report:

General

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

1. The frequency of COX-2 overexpression of SA is similar to that of non-serrated adenoma, but that of HP and SSA were significantly less than that of non-serrated adenoma. From these observations, authors concluded that COX-2 may play a less significant in serrated pathway in colorectal carcinogenesis. However, in considering that HP and SSA are considered to be precursors of SA and show lower grade of dysplasia, SA showed similar COX-2 overexpression to ordinary adenoma, in ordinary adenoma frequency of COX-2 overexpression depended on grade of dysplasia (Dis Colon Rectum 2003;46:786-792), COX-2 may play a some role of carcinogenesis even in serrated pathway. The authors should discuss about it.

2. The positive and negative controls for COX-2 immunohistochemistry should be described.

3. Fig. 1 includes only highly magnified photos, and it is difficult to identify which is HP, SSA and SA.

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

1. "proximal tumor" and "distal tumor" should be "tumor of the proximal colon" and "tumor of the distal colon", respectively.

2. Page 4: "COX-2 specific inhibitor" should be "COX-2 selective inhibitor"

3. Legend of Fig. 1B: "Mixed adenoma" should be "Mixed polyp"

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions
Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.