Reviewer's report

Title: Prognostic factors for breast cancer patients with axillary lymph node dissection (pathological stage I-III) and the reversal of survival rate between estrogen receptor positive and negative breast cancer patients after long term survival

Version: 1 Date: 9 April 2008
Reviewer: philippe chollet

Reviewer's report:

1 - The question posed by the authors appears well defined
2 - However, it deals with prognostic value of hormonal receptors on DFS and OS in breast cancer: this retrospective review is not fully described, as many details come from another published paper (ref 4). This details should be fully explicated as we cannot elaborate on them. Moreover in table 1 ER status is unknown on 19.5% of cases and PgR status is not given.
3 - Authors should precise if this series represents all patients from their institution operated for breast cancer during the given period, or a selected series among other patients.
   Neoadjuvant and adjuvant therapies should be precised. We understand from line 4 page 5 that a special pathological review was done for the work, to be confirmed.
4 - Methods of evaluation of ER and PgR status should be precised.
5 - Bottom of page 5: median follow up time was 5.7 years and conclusions are drawn at 10 and 20 years: this is a big difference.
6 - The results obtained are probably due to the habitual relapse pattern of breast cancer in two waves: hormonal receptors negative tumors in the first years, versus HR positive tumors later: this should be said and referenced.
7 - Hence the point evidenced from the present paper could be a somewhat different timing in the shift between the two relapses phase: this deserves a revision of the paper to establish this interesting point.