Reviewer’s report

Title: The clinicopathological and prognostic impact of 14-3-3 sigma expression on vulvar squamous cell carcinomas

Version: 1 Date: 27 August 2008

Reviewer: Mong Hong Lee

Reviewer’s report:

Wang et al. described the 1433 sigma (sigma) expression in vulvar carcinomas. 1433 sigma functions as a tumor suppressor, and it is important to characterize its role in cancer. The authors have tried to investigate the role of sigma in vulvar squamous carcinomas (VSCC). However, the manuscript is presenting negative data, and the studies are very superficial. Thus, the manuscript is not novel enough to warrant publication in BMC Cancer. The following are other major concerns.

The following are other major concerns.

The title is clinicopathological and prognostic impact of sigma on VSCC. All the results in this paper are negative. Although they found that sigma is highly expressed in VSCC, they found no correlation with sigma expression and survival of VSCC, reducing the interest of this study.

Criticisms of Fig2, In this figure they show sigma expression by western from 2 VSCC cell lines but there is no loading control and nothing to compare levels of sigma with, example, no normal cell line sigma expression data. This observation did not provide any useful information.

In Fig.3, the authors should address whether the low expression of sigma is due to the promoter methylation. Presenting the mRNA expression from random cases does not have any biological significance or mean anything.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests