Reviewer's report

Title: Nuclear hBD-1 accumulation in malignant salivary gland tumours

Version: 1 Date: 11 February 2008

Reviewer: Geovanni Cassali

Reviewer's report:

The purpose of this study was to investigate the cellular distribution of hBD-1, -2, -3, p53 and bcl-2 in benign and malignant salivary gland tumours. The work is interesting and could represent a contribution in this field of investigation. Defensins expression in benign and malignant salivary gland tumors is still under investigation. In my opinion, material and methods needs to be reviewed:

1) the sample size is too small;
2) the immunohistochemistry analysis is superficial, a quantitative or semi-quantitative method is preferred.
3) the chosen methodology for immunohistochemistry analysis needs to be referenced.
4) It is necessary a statistic analysis.

A better description of tumors is necessary. Ex.: There are three major variant histologic growth patterns of ACC: cribriform, tubular and solid. The solid pattern is associated with a more aggressive disease course. The expression of markers could be different.

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.