Reviewer's report

Title: Nuclear hBD-1 accumulation in malignant salivary gland tumours

Version: 1 Date: 11 January 2008

Reviewer: Thomas Pufe

Reviewer's report:

1. Is the question posed by the authors new and well defined? Yes
2. Are the methods appropriate and well described, and are sufficient details provided to replicate the work? Yes
3. Are the data sound and well controlled? Yes
4. Does the manuscript adhere to the relevant standards for reporting and data deposition? Yes
5. Are the discussion and conclusions well balanced and adequately supported by the data? Yes
6. Do the title and abstract accurately convey what has been found? See below
7. Is the writing acceptable? Yes

In the study "Nuclear hBD-1 accumulation in malignant salivary gland tumours" Wenghoefer et al. investigated the expression of human beta defensin 1, 2 and 3 in salivary glands and salivary gland tumours. For this purpose the authors used immunohistochemical techniques. Wenghoefer et al. conclude that hBD-1 may play a role as tumour suppressor gene.

General comments:

In my pdf version of the manuscript an abstract is missing.


The study would benefit from a fusion of the single figures. It would be more easy to compare the shift from the cytoplasm to the nucleus.

The authors depict hBD-1, -2 and -3 in healthy salivary glands but only hBD-1 in salivary gland tumours. The authors should add pictures from hBD-2 and -3 from salivary gland tumours.

The authors should discuss the expression of human beta defensins in other diseases like osteoarthritis (Varoga et al. J Pathol. 2006 Jun;209(2):166-73) or Rheumatoid Arthritis (Paulsen et al. J Pathol. 2002 Nov;198(3):369-77).

Minor comments:

There are some typographical errors.