Reviewer's report

Title: High-resolution array CGH clarifies events occurring on 8p in carcinogenesis.

Version: 2 Date: 18 September 2008

Reviewer: Mattias Hoglund

Reviewer's report:

The revised manuscript “High resolution array CGH clarifies events occurring on 8p in carcinogenesis” of Cooke et al.

The authors have responded satisfactorily the comments and performed the essential experimental analyses needed to arrive at the original conclusions. I am also pleased that the authors agreed on the possible alternative interpretations of their data. I still do not agree that the choice of colour coding (point 6) for gains (green) and losses (red) is a good alternative. It will be confusing when presenting aCGH and expression data from the same investigating in the form of heat maps. This discrepancy in opinions should however not affect the decision for publication or not.

Major Compulsory Revisions; none
Minor Essential Revisions; none
Discretionary Revisions; none

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests