Reviewer's report

**Title:** Prognostic Relevance of Centromere Protein H Expression in esophageal carcinoma.

**Version:** 1  **Date:** 31 May 2008

**Reviewer:** Hideo Shigeishi

**Reviewer's report:**

The authors examined the expression of CENP-H mRNA in esophageal carcinomas by RT-PCR. They also examined CENP-H protein expression in 177 esophageal carcinomas (squamous cell carcinomas and adenocarcinomas) by immunohistochemistry and compared IHC results with clinicopathologic factors. Authors concluded that CENP-H expression were prognostic indicators in esophageal carcinomas. The study is focused with some interesting results, but several uncertain issues should be addressed.

1. I wonder why the authors combined the data of both different histological types (171 squamous cell carcinomas and 6 adenocarcinomas) in IHC analysis. There are some confusion as for the analysis.

2. In Fig. 3, CENP-H protein expression seemed to be observed in cytoplasm of tumor cells. Tumor cell nuclei stained above the background level, regardless of intensity, is considered positively stained. Immunohistochemical data should be added to confirm the expression of CENP-H as nuclear protein. Furthermore, the authors presented the positive cell ratio as the number of nuclear stained tumor cells immunostained per 1000 carcinoma cells. Description about #score# should be needed precisely in detail.

3. The authors should address more discussion about correlation between CENP-H expression and proliferation activities of the tumor.

4. In results section (page 13), line 13-14, # Please do Spearman correlation analysis. Otherwise you can not get this conclusion# should be deleted.

5. There is also some grammatical errors in the text.

**Level of interest:** An article of importance in its field

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests.