Reviewer’s report

Title: Recurrent and multiple bladder tumors show conserved expression profiles

Version: 1 Date: 15 March 2008

Reviewer: Robert Stoehr

Reviewer’s report:

Major Compulsory Revisions:

1. In the method section the authors stated that "tumor pathology was reviewed by one pathologist". Unfortunately, the authors gave no information about the content of tumor cells within the samples used for the analyses. Have the authors performed a precise microdissection? How can the authors exclude working with material that is highly contaminated with "normal cells" (e.g. stroma)?

2. The authors stated that "all identified mutations were verified by reverse sequencing". Mutations should not be verified by sequencing the reverse strand only. A second, independently generated amplicon should be analysed to verify a mutation. Could the authors verify all mutations found or were there any discrepancies when analysing the reverse strand? Please discuss!

3. The authors did not verify the LOH results. Own experience showed that LOH could also be a result of preferential PCR amplification, therefore a verification of a LOH by a second independently performed analysis is absolutely necessary!

Minor Essential Revisions:

1. In the background section, the authors used the term "superficial tumors" for pTa and pT1 tumors. Several studies have proven, that pTa and pT1 tumors display totally different biological processes and levels of aggressiveness. Therefore these tumor stages must not be grouped together. The terms "non-invasive" and "invasive" should be used for pTa and pT1 tumors as it is already suggested in the actual WHO classification.

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.