Reviewer's report

Title: No influence of the MDM2 SNP309 on early onset lung cancer in a Caucasian population

Version: 1 Date: 30 October 2007

Reviewer: Hongbing B Shen

Reviewer's report:

General
This study briefly described a case-control study including 635 lung cancer cases and 1300 controls on the association between the SNP309 in the promoter region of MDM2 and lung cancer risk in a Caucasian population, and no significant association was observed. Although the study may be adequately designed, a negative result on a single candidate locus of MDM2 in a single type of cancer does not attain high enough publication priority in BMC cancer.

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

No

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

1. Because the study included cases from two existing studies, please describe and compare the characteristics of two case groups in the Study population and Result sections.

2. In the Result section, the author reported the characteristics of study population, but the difference of selected variables between cases and controls did not be tested.

3. In Table 1, the sum of men (N=405) and women (N=228) was not equal to the total number of cases (N=635).

4. In Table 2, please add the number of different genotypes in cases and controls. And the notes for the stratification may be wrong: * should mean the results stratified by gender and ** should mean the results stratified by histology.

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

1. Please define “packyears” in the Statistical analysis.

2. In Discussion section, some information should be added to explain the distinction of results between this study and other studies for the association between MDM2 polymorphisms and lung cancer.
What next?: Reject because too small an advance to publish

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

'I declare that I have no competing interests'