Reviewer's report

Title: No influence of the MDM2 SNP309 on early onset lung cancer in a Caucasian population

Version: 1 Date: 9 October 2007

Reviewer: Qingyi Wei

Reviewer's report:

General:
This is another negative study on the role of the polymorphism SNP309 (rs2279744) in the promoter region of the MDM2 gene in lung cancer risk. This is a fairly large population-based study, particularly including relatively young cases (<51 years). The study design appears to be sound and the analysis was adequate.

Specific:
1. One recent report available online now was missed in the discussion. This report presented a combined analysis of MDM2 SNP309 and risk of several cancers, including lung cancer (Wilkening S et al, Carcinogenesis. 2007 Sep 7; [Epub ahead of print]). It is likely that the authors did not have the opportunity to read it online yet at the time of submission.
2. The authors did mention one (Li et al. [2006]) of the large studies of Caucasian populations published to date in the Discussion, but this report was not listed in the references. Therefore, the authors need to check their references carefully to make sure that other reports mentioned in the text were not missed in the references.
3. Table 1: for the frequency of MDM2 SNP309, conventionally the common genotype (TT) should be on the top and rare genotype (GG) listed last.
4. Table 2: it would be more informative if the numbers of the subjects were also presented for each of the strata.

Recommendation: Major Compulsory Revisions

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.
Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests