Reviewer's report

Title: Induction of lung lesions in Wistar rats by 4-(methylnitrosamino)-1-(3-pyridyl)-1-butanone and their inhibitions by aspirin and phenethyl isothiocyanate.

Version: 2 Date: 9 November 2006

Reviewer: Katsumi Imaida

Reviewer's report:

General

Any treatment during the experiment should be described in detail in Materials and Methods. In your 'answers respond to reviewers' regarding inflammatory changes, authors described that "... after instillation we usually gave rats streptomycin 250mg/kg body weight and penicillin 100000 U/kg body weight by muscle injection for 7 days to decrease the infection." NNK/MCA treatment was only once by intratraheal instillation. However the 7 times injections of antibiotics were very important treatment for the rats in terms of inflammation process. Authers did not describe these important treatments in the manuscript, even in the revised manuscript. Again, any treatment during the experiment should be described in detail.

What next?: Reject because scientifically unsound

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.