Reviewer's report

Title: Induction of lung lesions in Wistar rats by 4-(methylnitrosamino)-1-(3-pyridyl)-1-butanone and their inhibitions by aspirin and phenethyl isothiocyanate.

Version: 2 Date: 14 November 2006

Reviewer: Myung-Haing CHO

Reviewer's report:

The authors’ cover letter indicated that the aim of current work is to declare whether aspirin and/or PEITC have effects in early stage of tumor progression. However, conclusion of their manuscript said that a single dose of 25 mg/kg body weight NNK is sufficient to induce preneoplastic lesions in Wistar rats by tracheal instillation and COX-2 plays an important role in both MCA and NNK induced tumorigenesis (please look at the conclusion part of revised manuscript). In the cover letter, the authors insisted that chemoprevention should be used in the early stage of tumorigenesis. I do agree with authors’ cover letter. Authors also indicated that their aim is to declare whether aspirin, PEITC have anti-progression effects. However, their conclusion dose not contain such important information. They insisted that COX-2 plays an important role in tumor genesis, however, such observation is found elsewhere. This is why this reviewer suggested that current manuscript does not contain new information. I, therefore, strongly suggest that authors should wrap this manuscript in somewhat different way. That is to say, please do take advantage of what authors insisted in cover letter in main text, thus, please let the readers have get the benefits.

In summary, I do appreciate authors extensive works and am very impressed the amount of efforts and works done. However, conclusion of current manuscript is not well matched with the purpose of the study.