Reviewer's report

Title: Gastrointestinal Stromal Tumour of the Duodenum in Childhood: A Rare Case Report

Version: 3 Date: 13 December 2006

Reviewer: Anette Duensing

Reviewer's report:

General

Chiarugi et al. submitted a revised version of their manuscript entitled “Gastrointestinal Stromal Tumor of the Duodenum in Childhood: A Rare Case Report”. The report describes the case history of a gastrointestinal stromal tumor that arose in the duodenum of a 14-year old boy.

The authors have addressed the concerns that were raised by both reviewers. Most importantly, they have now included mutational analysis as well as a more thorough family history to exclude Carney’s triad, NF1 and familial GIST. However, some issues still remain that preclude publication in the present form.

********************************************************************************

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

1. The authors have now included a more detailed discussion of GIST biology and treatment (p.2 and p.3). However, the additional text on p.3 may lead to some misconception in its current form. Most adult GISTs (80-90%) are caused by mutations in the KIT or PDGFRA receptor tyrosine kinase genes. This makes them amenable to therapy with the kinase inhibitor imatinib. Therefore, these patients have a better prognosis than patients with KIT/PDGFRA wildtype tumors because their GISTs usually respond to therapy. The references that the authors cited refer to a time before imatinib was available. On the other hand, most pediatric GISTs do not harbor mutations of KIT or PDGFRA (like the case presented here) and therefore unfortunately do not respond well to kinase inhibitors like imatinib. Nevertheless, pediatric GISTs generally do have a more benign course than adult cases. The authors should clarify this aspect.

********************************************************************************

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

1. Abbreviations are usually introduced in parentheses after the words are first mentioned in the text:
   - … abdominal ultrasound (US) …
   - … pertecnate 99m (Tc99m) scintigraphy …

Please change accordingly.

********************************************************************************

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.