Reviewer’s report

Title: Gastrointestinal Stromal Tumour of the Duodenum in Childhood: A Rare Case Report

Version: 1 Date: 20 August 2006

Reviewer: Anette Duensing

Reviewer’s report:

General

The manuscript entitled “Gastrointestinal Stromal Tumor of the Duodenum in Childhood: A Rare Case Report” by Chiarugi et al. describes the case history of a gastrointestinal stromal tumor (GIST) that arose in the duodenum of a 14-year old boy.

Pediatric GIST is a rare disease, and most of these tumors arise in locations other than the duodenum. However, this report adds little new information to the existing body of data and would be better suited for a more specialized journal.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

1. The vast majority of adult GISTs are caused by mutations in the KIT or PDGFRA receptor tyrosine kinase genes, respectively. Mutational analysis or other molecular diagnostic follow-up procedures were not performed for the present case. However, this is essential since pediatric GISTs appear to be a different clinical and molecular entity than adult GISTs.

2. The general differences between pediatric/adult and gastric/small bowel GISTs (different mutational status, histopathology, response to imatinib therapy) are not discussed.

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

1. The abbreviations used in the text should be introduced when first mentioned (e.g., US, TC…).

2. According to the guidelines of BMC Cancer, written and signed consent forms should be included when reporting case reports and presenting clinical photographs. These consent forms were not included in the version of the manuscript that I received for review. Please disregard this comment if the forms were obtained at the BMC Cancer editorial office.

What next?: Reject because too small an advance to publish

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.