Reviewer's report

Title: HNPCC versus sporadic microsatellite-unstable colon cancers follow different routes toward loss of HLA class I expression

Version: 1 Date: 20 November 2006
Reviewer: Jae-Gahb G Park

Reviewer's report:

This study was aimed to characterize the HLA class I expression among sporadic MSI-H, microsatellite stable tumors, and HNPCC. Authors insisted that sporadic and hereditary MSI-H tumors follow different routes toward HLA class I loss of expression supporting the idea that these tumors follow different evolutionary pathways in tumorigenesis.

Major comments

This is an interesting design and sufficient numbers of samples were investigated. Authors investigated the relationship between HLA class I expression and MSI status in colorectal cancers. It has been reported that BRAF mutation and hMLH1 promoter methylation was positively associated with MSI. Thus, it will be very interesting to further investigate BRAF mutation (exons 11 and 15) and hMLH1 methylation in this study. The different genetic or epigenetic patterns may be shown in sporadic MSI-H colorectal cancers and HNPCC. It is also interesting that BRAF mutation and hMLH1 methylation patterns might be associated with HLA class I expression.

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests