Reviewer's report

Title: Disease-specific survival for limited-stage small-cell lung cancer affected by statistical method of assessment

Version: 8 Date: 8 February 2007

Reviewer: Andrew Roddam

Reviewer's report:

General

The revised version of this manuscript is much improved and adequately addresses all of the points raised during the previous review round. There are a couple of minor issues which the authors do need to address.

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

1. For ease/clarity can the authors please also include numbers of events by year and within each subgroup in Tables 2 and 3, as well as in the main body of the results.
2. In the final conclusions section the authors conclude that the log-Normal model should be considered more frequently in these scenarios. Can I suggest that this be reworded to parametric survival models since there is no evidence that the log-Normal would, globally, be the most appropriate model. It just happens that it shows the best fit for the particular data set used by the authors.

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Accept after discretionary revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests