Author's response to reviews

Title: Disease-specific survival for limited-stage small-cell lung cancer affected by statistical method of assessment

Authors:

Patricia Tai (patricia.tai@scf.sk.ca)
Judith-Anne W Chapman (JChapman@ctg.queensu.ca)
Edward Yu (Edward.Yu@lhsc.on.ca)
Dennie Jones (DVJones@salud.unm.edu)
Changhong Yu (CYu@ctg.queensu.ca)
Fei Yuen (Fyuan@ctg.queensu.ca)
Sang-Joon Lee (SJLee@salud.unm.edu)

Version: 9 Date: 10 February 2007

Author's response to reviews:

To the Editor:

Reply to Reviewer: Andrew Roddam's comments.

Minor Essential Revisions:

1. For ease/clarity can the authors please also include numbers of events by year and within each subgroup in Tables 2 and 3, as well as in the main body of the results.

We have supplied the numbers of events by year in Table 2,

"By 1 year, 42 of 238 (17.6%) of patients died from lung cancer; by 3 years, 173 of 230 (75.2%); and by 5 years, 186 of 223 (83.4%)."

This was already in the text on page 12, first sentence of Results.

We have added the last sentence of Results, "The subgroups contained a total of 8 patients and 4 events." to Table 3.

2. In the final conclusions section the authors conclude that the log-Normal model should be considered more frequently in these scenarios. Can I suggest that this be reworded to parametric survival models since there is no evidence that the log-Normal would, globally, be the most appropriate model. It just happens that it shows the best fit for the particular data set used by the authors.

We agree to a wording along the lines suggested for the indicated sentence in the Conclusion, and have changed it to read:

"Parametric models should be considered more frequently for survival analysis to assess prognostic and predictive effects; like Royston [11] and Chapman et al. [16], we found here that the log-normal was an appropriate parametric model choice."

Manuscript formatting checklist:

Figure legends - In the manuscript file, the figure legends are placed before the tables.
Figures - The figure is cropped as closely as possible to minimise white space around the image.