Reviewer's report

Title: Genomic imbalances in 5918 malignant epithelial tumors: An explorative meta-analysis of chromosomal CGH data.

Version: 3 Date: 25 August 2007

Reviewer: Bradley Coe

Reviewer's report:

General

The revised manuscript is improved over the previous version however a few minor issues still need to be addressed prior to publication.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

Regarding the lack of citations in the discussion, although I appreciate the overview nature of this manuscript, when regions are discussed it is necessary to clarify the current state of knowledge (with at least one citation for well known features) such that the novel characteristics of the study are apparent.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Table I and the figure legends are absent from the files I received.

There is still a lack of detail on the definition of background and how regions were selected above the background (pages 5+). This should be clarified so that the reader is capable of determining if this portion of the study is systematic or not.

Figure 3 requires a legend for the “clinico-path entity” and “histological group” colour coding scheme.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field
Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests