Author's response to reviews

Title: Genomic imbalances in 5918 malignant epithelial tumors: An explorative meta-analysis of chromosomal CGH data.

Authors:

    Michael Baudis (mbaudis@gmail.com)

Version: 4 Date: 3 October 2007

Author's response to reviews: see over
Dear Dr. Le Good,

I am glad to provide you with a re-submission of the manuscript. In this revision, I have tried to satisfy the remaining request of reviewer no. 3:

Major Compulsory Revisions:
Regarding the lack of citations in the discussion, although I appreciate the overview nature of this manuscript, when regions are discussed it is necessary to clarify the current state of knowledge (with at least one citation for well known features) such that the novel characteristics of the study are apparent.

For each entity, a brief (1-3 sentence) comment on outstanding features of the imbalance profile has been added. This includes references, frequently to review articles or studies which are not included in the database (e.g. due to lack of data access), but corroborate the observations or provide an addtl. level of information (e.g. gene specific data). Inevitably, this has increased the number of citations from 49 to now 84. Additionally, table 2 has been amended by another column listing one or a few well characterized oncogenes and tumor suppressor genes, respectively, for each of the frequently observed changes.
Minor Essential Revisions:

Table I and the figure legends are absent from the files I received.

This will be double-checked during the submission process.

There is still a lack of detail on the definition of background and how regions were selected above the background (pages 5+). This should be clarified so that the reader is capable of determining if this portion of the study is systematic or not.

By changing of the wording, I have tried to make the selection process more clear.

Figure 3 requires a legend for the “clinico-path entity” and “histological group” colour coding scheme.

The "supplementary figures" file has been amended by 2 box plot figures, which show the frequency of imbalanced chromosomes for cases with imbalances only, both for clinico-pathological entity and histological group. The different entities/groups are color coded and match the color bar code in figure 3. The figure legend 3 refers to this.

Besides the extension of the entity specific discussion, the basic wording of the article has not been changed substantially.

As per request, "Competing Interests" and "Author's Contributions" sections have been inserted.

I am positive, that the manuscript in its current state will satisfy the wishes of reviewers as well as editors, and would be delighted to see it processed soon.

With kind regards from Switzerland,

Michael Baudis.