Title: Deficiency of G1 regulators P53, P21Cip1 and/or pRB decreases hepatocyte sensitivity to TGFbeta cell cycle arrest

Version: 1 Date: 18 September 2007

Reviewer: Luigi Bagella

Reviewer's report:

In this manuscript entitled “Deficiency of G1 regulators P53, P21Cip1 and/or pRB decreases hepatocyte sensitivity to TGF# cell cycle arrest” the Authors suggest that the TGF# inhibition of proliferation could be correlated to G1 regulators such as P53, P21Cip1 and/or pRb. Specifically they show that hepatocytes with disabled pRB function, or P21Cip1 and p53 respond less well to the antiproliferative effects of TGF#.

The manuscript is well written and the experiments are valid and convincing. All the data presented are very supportive and lead to a better understanding of the mechanisms of the chronic liver disease. Therefore, I recommend the publication of this manuscript in BMC Cancer.

What next?: Accept without revision

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.