Reviewer's report

Title: Clonal mutations in primary human glial tumors: evidence in support of the mutator hypothesis

Version: 3 Date: 18 June 2007

Reviewer: GR Anderson

Reviewer's report:

General
The issue of genomic instability in cancer is of great importance, and the authors have made a serious study of the degree of one form of instability in glial tumors.

--------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached) This manuscript bears many similarities to a previous publication by the same authors in the Journal of Neuro-Oncology in 2000. It is essential to clearly identify what are the NEW findings and conclusions.

--------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct). Page 4 paragraph 3 line 7. The reference cited (#15) for colorectal cancers studied the special case of HNPCC, which does not provide a general comparison for overall genetic aberrations and malignancy grade.

--------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests: I declare that I have no competing interests.