Reviewer's report

Title: Increased mRNA levels of interferon alpha receptor 2 is associated with metastasis of renal cell carcinoma

Version: 2 Date: 17 November 2006

Reviewer: Guorong Li

Reviewer's report:

The TNM stage and histological grade are the major predictors of RCC prognosis. But they are not individualized. The study of molecular markers is needed to improve the predictive power of the stage and grade. The authors evaluated the interferon alpha receptor 2 as a new molecular prognostic marker in RCC. The major concerns with this article are:

1: The authors performed the qRT-PCR. They found the tumor/normal ratio had a significant value for the prognosis while the results of qRT-PCR of tumor tissue was not a predictor of prognosis. This finding is strange. The qRT-PCR is usually performed to compare the expression levels between the tumor and normal tissues. The high or low level of tumor tissue is usually compared to see if the expression level has a prognostic value. It is difficult to imagine if the tumor/normal ratio can reflect the expression level of the marker in the tumor tissue. The authors should provide some strong explanations or references. The IHC or western blot can be done to examine if the relationship between the prognosis and this marker truly exists.

2: The subtypes of RCC should be indicated. The subtype is of important prognostic value. The authors should indicate the numbers of each subtypes and study a specific subtype such as the clear cell RCC or other subtypes.

3: The results of this marker expression in bladder and testicular cancer are not related to this article. These results may not be presented.

4: Some English grammar errors are obvious, but they can be easily corrected.

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.