Reviewer's report

Title: Adjuvant Trastuzumab in the Treatment of HER-2-Positive Early Breast Cancer: A meta-analyses of published randomized trials.

Version: 3 Date: 7 June 2007

Reviewer: Andrew Roddam

Reviewer's report:

General

On the whole the authors have responded adequately to most of my previous reviews comments and I have only a few minor issues. However I still fail to find the motivation for this meta-analysis/review as it basically confirms what is already known and clear from the 5 large scale, adequately powered randomised trials that have been performed.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

1. The authors continue to present the result of a fixed effects analysis for cardiotoxicity even though there is heterogeneity. They also claim that the insignificant result for a random effects model is insignificant. Given that this p=0.07 and heterogeneity tests are known to be underpowered this is still suggestive that there is residual heterogeneity between studies. My recommendation is therefore not to present a single estimate but to say that there was considerable heterogeneity and the overall results are dominated by one single study which renders the meta-analysis quite uninformative. They can of course say that it would appear that there is an increase in cardiac risk associated with HER2 (as I recommended in my previous review).

2. There are still places in the results section (and elsewhere in the manuscript) where the English does not make sense and it is difficult to assess the point the authors are trying to make.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests