Reviewer's report

Title: A phase II trial of docetaxel and erlotinib as first-line therapy for elderly patients with androgen-independent prostate cancer

Version: 1 Date: 13 April 2007

Reviewer: Jonathan Rosenberg

Reviewer's report:

General
This is a small well conducted study of docetaxel and erlotinib in elderly patients with metastatic hormone refractory prostate cancer. The authors have picked a patient population that has not been completely described in other clinical trials of advanced prostate cancer in an attempt to define a chemotherapy regimen that may be more suitable for elderly patients. This is a single arm study without a control, although the authors do report historic data to place this in the context of the treatment of HRPC.

1. The authors do not mention any secondary hormonal manipulations that may have been tried prior to initiation of chemotherapy. If this information is available then it should be reported in the manuscript.

2. The Halabi nomogram and other work have suggested that Gleason scores have predictive value even in advanced disease. While the patients appeared to have good survival compared to prior randomized studies, applying the Halabi nomogram might give a sense of whether the survival observed would be similar to what is predicted based on pre-treatment characteristics. In addition, Gleason scores should be reported, even in advanced prostate cancer, if available.

--------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

--------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

--------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)