Reviewer's report

Title: A novel BRCA-1 mutation in Arab kindred from east Jerusalem with breast and ovarian cancer

Version: 3 Date: 8 December 2006

Reviewer: Fernando Schmitt

Reviewer's report:

General

As stated in my last review, the study of BRCA genes is of paramount for the study of populations with genetic predisposition to breast and ovarian cancers. Although the article has been improved there are still some comments that need the authors’ attention before publishing it.

Major Compulsory Revisions

1- The authors need to review the abstract since there is a “cancer” missing. By this I mean, in line 7-8 when you state that “We studied the family history of (...) affected with breast (n=28), ovarian (n=3).” I believe it is affected with cancer, right?

2- I strongly advise a re-written of the study population section (in the methods) since, in the opinion of this reviewer, it is a bit confusing. I suggest trying to explain it in a schematic manner.

3- I believe that the article had much to gain if the authors had conducted a fully mutational analysis in all 31 analyzed cases, however one might not forget that although incomplete, this article brings to the field of BRCA mutational analysis a new mutation (E1373X). My suggestion in this matter is that the authors try to better emphasize the importance of such studies for future development of routine screenings in these populations (do not be restricted to the conclusions, try to stress it throughout the text).

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

'I declare that I have no competing interests'