Reviewer's report

Title: A novel BRCA-1 mutation in Arab kindred from east Jerusalem with breast and ovarian cancer

Version: 1 Date: 7 November 2006

Reviewer: Orland Diez

Reviewer's report:

General
This is a nice piece of work and the objectives, methodology used, description of results and conclusions are correct. This manuscript makes a valuable contribution to the BRCA mutational studies in breast cancer predisposition in a specific population.

-------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)
In material and methods, at the end of the first paragraph, authors describe BRCA2 screening by DHPLC divided only in 27 fragments. I think this is a low number for such a long gene. Is this number correct? In this case, fragments would be very long and this can have consequences in sensitivity in DHPLC screening. Authors should clarify this aspect.

In discussion, authors describe the family with the E1373X mutation and consider the family history as a typical for a BRCA1 carrier, with women affected with BC and OC. However, according to the family tree in the figure, there is a male BC case, that has been not analysed, which is most typical of a BRCA2 family. Authors should point out this aspect.

-------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)
In the third paragraph of the background the report of mutations in Arab patients should be referenced

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests