Reviewer's report

Title: Health Profiles of 996 Melanoma Survivors: the M. D. Anderson Experience

Version: 3 Date: 6 February 2006

Reviewer: Alv Dahl

Reviewer's report:

General

---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)
1) What is the meaning of the last sentence of the first paragraph in Background: “However, research on cancer survivorship in adults has been generally limited to recognized treatment options and their side effects rather than the long-term outcome of survivors.”
2) In the Methods I find that some of the “health conditions or symptoms” they refer to are self-evident, but I miss some definitions such as what are the differences between heart problems and circulation problems. Did the authors give some instructions and definitions, or was this left completely up to the survivors?

---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)
The decimals on per cents and p-values could be reduced.
Based on your assessment of the validity of the manuscript, what do you advise should be the next step?

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:
'I declare that I have no competing interests'