Reviewer's report

Title: Genomic alterations identified by array comparative genomic hybridization as prognostic markers in tamoxifen-treated estrogen receptor-positive breast cancer

Version: 1 Date: 5 December 2005

Reviewer: pulivarthi rao

Reviewer's report:

Han et al reports genetic prognostic markers in tamoxifen-treated estrogen receptor-positive breast tumors by array comparative genomic hybridization. The present paper identified loss of 11p15.5-p15.4, 1p36.33, 11q13.1 and 11p11.2 in recurrent group of tumors. In addition, the authors identified significant differences in DNA copy numbers between Recurrence and Non-recurrence groups.

Comments:
1. The major drawback for this paper is the identification of genes within the amplified or lost clones.
2. Methods: The authors should provide a brief description of method for survival analysis and reference.
3. Page 11: (First paragraph): To validate array CGH data, the authors performed real-time PCR for 8q21.13. What clone(s) used to perform this analysis?
4. Page 11: These regions------. The authors should correlate their findings with published expression data on breast tumors.
5. This study potentially identified three chromosomal regions i.e. 11p15, 8q21 and 1p36 that are associated with distant recurrence. The authors fail to demonstrate clinical significance of 1p36 region and the genes present in the respective BAC clones.
6. Page 13: Although......... The sentence needs to be rephrased.
7. Figure 3: The figure legend is not informative. What real-time PCR data was correlated with array CGH?

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No