Reviewer's report

Title: Mammaglobin A and lipophilin B are co-expressed in breast cancer and gynecologic malignancies

Version: 1 Date: 23 January 2006

Reviewer: Timothy Fleming

Reviewer's report:

General

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)
The authors have provided very interesting data that suggests that mammaglobin and lipophilin B are strongly expressed in cervical, uterine, and ovarian tumors, along with the breast cancer material. The data is very reliant on a commercial dot blot array, containing synthesized cDNAs from tumor and normal matched tissue specimens. And this data is not quantitative. To verify this preliminary finding, the authors should analyze tumor samples and normal control material, ideally intra-patients samples to confirm this in a more quantitative and meaningful assay - qRT/PCR or IHC analysis. This will validate the promising data obtained in the tissue array analysis. An additional validation experiment, using a small number of patient samples (5-10), is necessary to confirm and validate the findings. IHC could be done on paraffin-fixed samples - antibodies that recognize mammaglobin/lipoB protein are available through Zeta-Corporation (USA) and AgriSera (www.agrisera.se).

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)
Figure 2 - while being very informative, was very difficult to follow. It would be better to label the panels, with the tissue name, so it is easier to read and understand

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

I have received licensing fees that are directly connected with the use of mammaglobin as a biomarker in breast cancer. I am co-author of patents that relate to this work.