Reviewer's report

Title: Evaluation of the Kinase Domain of c-KIT in Canine Cutaneous Mast Cell Tumors

Version: Date: 3 February 2006

Reviewer: Eva Wardelmann

Reviewer's report:

General
The authors describe a study concerning the mutational status in the c-kit gene in canine mast cell tumors. Their objective is to characterize the intracellular part of KIT, i.e. exon 16 - 20. However, activating mutations were not found in all 33 cases.

-----------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)
Unfortunately, the authors did not mention how the mutational status of these tumors was in the juxtamembranous domain (exon 11). They should add and comment this. Furthermore, as they discuss similarities and differences in comparison with human mast cell proliferations it would have been reasonable to examine also exon 8 and 9. For exon 89, it has been shown recently, that a family with GISTs and mastocytosis carries a germ line mutation in this region.
Taken together, it is rather disappointing that the reader does not get much new ideas concerning these interesting tumors. -----------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

-----------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

-----------------------------------------------

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.