Reviewer's report

Title: CARCINOSARCOMA ARISING IN A DERMOID CYST OF OVARY: A CASE REPORT Report of a Unique Case with Immunohistochemical Evidence of monoclonal origin

Version: 1 Date: 30 August 2005

Reviewer: w glenn G mccluggage

Reviewer's report:

General

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

1. the abstract does not mention the word ovary and gives no details regarding the sarcomatous element of the neoplasm.
2. the figure 1b does not resemble endometrial stromal sarcoma. I think reference to the sarcomatous component of the tumour resembling endometrial stromal sarcoma should be removed from the text as ESS is a low grade bland neoplasm which does not resemble the tumour described.
3. it is stated in the BACKGROUND section that refs 5 and 6 are from the same author. This is not the case.
4. the first time MMMT is mentioned in the text this should be spelt out in full.
5. there are several references discussing the monoclonal origin of carcinosarcoma and these should be referenced eg WG McCluggage, J Clin Pathol 2002,55,321-5.

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.