Reviewer's report

Title: Nestin expression in the cell lines derived from glioblastoma multiforme.

Version: 3 Date: 12 October 2005

Reviewer: Robert A Ross

Reviewer's report:

General

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached) NONE

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

1. Since the karyotypes have been removed from the paper, the section in “Methods” (page 7) on “Karyotyping” and the the preceding sentence concerning colchicine treatment should likewise be deleted.

2. The new paragraph at the beginning of the Results section, changed in response to both reviewers’ comments, is perhaps too brief. The sentence about GM7 is fine, but slightly more information is necessary to prove the tumor origin of GM10: to say that it is “near-diploid” is not enough. Add back the number of gain/lost chromosomes and of marker chromosomes? Also, if you did FISH, CGH, and HR-CGH, why not mention that in the text or omit it from the manuscript?

3. The new results section, page 10, last sentence, top paragraph states that “a portion of nestin-positive cells was progressively reduced up to complete . . . . This is very confusing English and must be modified.

4. The description for E in Figure 8 legend should be labeled F in the legend.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

1. The cells chosen for illustration for the software cross-section and co-location studies, showing nestin in the nucleus, all have the more wide-spread pattern of nestin filaments throughout the cytoplasm. Do cells with the smaller, discrete arrangement of nestin (as in Fig. 2C) also show nuclear nestin? If yes, is the nestin more frequently found in filamentous structures or spirals? Is there any difference in co-location with MTOC and/or microtubules? In other words, how general is this phenomenon.

2. This manuscript, and in particular the discussion section, requires editing for grammar and syntax.
What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

'I declare that I have no competing interests'