Reviewer's report

Title: Multidrug-resistance protein (MDR-1)'s prognostic significance in renal clear cell carcinomas: a five year follow-up analysis

Version: 1 Date: 17 October 2006

Reviewer: Rodolfo Montironi

Reviewer's report:

General
This is a potentially interesting study. However, I certain number of comments need to be made.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

- Type of tumour. The authors affirm that they used 30 consecutive carcinomas. According to them the carcinomas were all of clear type. Since there is a variety of types of carcinomas of the kidney, it is hard to believe that they were all of the same type.
- Page 4. There are clinic-pathological data that should go to the results section and should become part of statistical analysis.
- Page 5. The authors say that inter- and intra-observer variations were evaluated. However, there is no such an information in the text.
- Results and Discussion section. This section contains only Results and there is no discussion of the data.
- Conclusions. This section is quite long and should be designated as Discussion.
- Page 7, Second paragraph. The meaning of “inner surface of proximal tubule” is not clear. Do the authors refer to luminal surface? A reference for this paragraph is also needed.
- Page 14, Table 2. Tumour size. How was the threshold defined?
- Multivariate analysis is missing. This should be done and added.

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

- Page 10. The title of references 11 and 12 is missing.
- English needs to be improved.

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No