Author's response to reviews

Title: Prognostic significance of multidrug-resistance protein (MDR-1) in renal clear cell carcinomas: A five year follow-up analysis.

Authors:

Chiara Mignogna (chiara.mignogna@libero.it)
Stefania Staibano (staibano@unina.it)
Vincenzo Altieri (altieri@unina.it)
Gaetano De Rosa (gaderosa@unina.it)
Giuseppe Pannone (giuseppepannone@libero.it)
Angela Santoro (angelasantoro1@hotmail.it)
Rosanna Zamparese (rosannazamparese@libero.it)
Massimino D'Armiento (giuseppepannone@virgilio.it)
Romualdo Rocchetti (vangieson@libero.it)
Ernesto Mezza (mezza@unina.it)
Mario Nasti (mario.nasti@tin.it)
Viviana Strazzullo (graziafanara@libero.it)
Vittorino Montanaro (vincenzo.santoro.0@alice.it)
Massimo Mascolo (mmascolo@libero.it)
Pantaleo Bufo (p.bufo@unifg.it)

Version: 5  Date: 11 December 2006

Author's response to reviews:

Author's response to reviews

Definitive Title: 2306172411155395 Prognostic significance of multidrug-resistance protein (MDR-1) in renal clear cell carcinomas: A five year follow-up analysis.

Authors:

Mignogna Chiara (chiara.mignogna@libero.it)
Staibano Stefania (staibano@unina.it)
Altieri Vincenzo (altieri@unina.it)
De Rosa Gaetano (gaderosa@unina.it)
Pannone Giuseppe (giuseppepannone@virgilio.it)
Santoro Angela (angelasantoro1@hotmail.it)
Zamparese Rosanna (rosannazamparese@libero.it)
D'Armiento Massimino
Author's response to reviews:

Thank you for consideration of our manuscript for publication in your journal.

We are very grateful for your further revisions and for your lots of useful advice.

By this cover letter, we want to provide point-by-point responses to your comments.

Our paper has been written by observing and respecting the journal style.

We have tried to obtain a new revised and correctly formatted manuscript.

In light of the reviewers' comments, below, you can read a detailed description of all changes we have made since the previous version.

Reviewer's report 1

Previous Title: 2306172411155395: Prognostic significance of multidrug-resistance protein(MDR-1) in renal clear cell carcinomas: a five years follow-up analysis.

Date: 27 November 2006
Reviewer: Yoichi Mizutani

Reviewer's report:

General

Although the number of examined was too small, this manuscript is well written and conceived.

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

There are no comments.

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

There are no comments.

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

There are no comments.

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

What next?: Accept without revision.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest.

Quality of written English: Acceptable.

Statistical review: No.

Declaration of competing interests: I declare that I have no competing interests.
Previous Title: 2306172411155395: Prognostic significance of multidrug-resistance protein(MDR-1) in renal clear cell carcinomas: a five years follow-up analysis.

Version: 4

Date: 28 November 2006

Reviewer: Axel Merseburger

Reviewer's report

General

Regarding to my issues I think the authors have sufficiently revised the first version which makes me lead to the conclusion that this is manuscript is now suitable for publication.

------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

There are no comments.

------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

There are no comments.

------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

There are no comments.

------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

What next?: Accept without revision.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field.

Quality of written English: Acceptable.
Reviewer’s report:

General

There are no comments.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

None.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

1. The word immune-histochemistry should be replaced with immunohistochemistry.

We have done it.

2. Page 4. Sentence starting with "Histological reports regard..." What do the authors mean with "site"? Was it included in the study?
We mean the multicentric pattern of growth that has been included in the study; we have corrected and modified the sentence in this way: 'Histological reports regard histotype, size, multicentric pattern of growth, grade and stage...'

---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

1. The comparison with the Robson staging system could be omitted.

We have omitted it.

---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

What next?: Accept after discretionary revisions.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests.

Quality of written English: Acceptable.

Statistical review: No.

Declaration of competing interests: None.

Finally, we have correct paper title.

Please remember that, when you decide on acceptance our manuscript, a pro-forma invoice (as fax) can be addressed to:

Dr. Pio D'Errico

Fax: 0881 713032

Department of Surgical Sciences

University of Foggia

Foggia (ITALY)
With our best regards,

Dr. Giuseppe Pannone

Via S Giacomo dei Capri 63/E - 80131 Napoli - Italy

Telephone and Fax: +39 081 5608495

E-mail: giuseppepannone@virgilio.it