Reviewer’s report

Title: Dramatic tumour response to pemetrexed single-agent in an elderly patient with malignant peritoneal mesothelioma: a case report

Version: 1 Date: 8 September 2006

Reviewer: Tristan Yan

Reviewer’s report:

General

The authors described a single case of a 79 year-old patient with malignant peritoneal mesothelioma (MPM) treated with pemetrexed and obtained a good response. The authors concluded that pemetrexed alone is “an upfront treatment option” for MPM in elderly patients or those with poor performance status.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

The case report is too lengthy and there are some repetitions in the text, eg. abstract, background and discussion. For a case report, it needs to be succinct.

In the actual case presentation, the description of the case is confusing. In the last line of page 3, the authors said “no clinical or radiological investigations had been performed”, but the next line said, a CT of chest, abdomen and pelvis showed…”

The case is not presented in a systematic manner. It would be better if the authors would describe the case in the following order – history of presenting illness, past medical history/occupational exposure, clinical examinations, investigations (blood test, radiology and histopathology), treatment and then response.

The conclusion is too strong.

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

There are several grammatical errors throughout the manuscript, which need to be edited.

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

N/A

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests