Reviewer's report

Title: Ciliated Hepatic Foregut Cyst in a Patient With Renal Cell Carcinoma.

Version: 1 Date: 10 July 2006

Reviewer: patrick bastian

Reviewer's report:

General

---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

The authors report a rare case of CHFC i a patient with RCC. As they state this report seems anecdotal. nevertheless, there has not been a report of an associated disease.

The manuscript would greatly benefit if the authors discuss the potential link of CHFC and RCC (embryogenic, molecular,...).

What was done to work up the hematuria. Was a cystoscopy performed to rule out a tumor of the urinary bladder?

What about the follow up in this case? What do the authors suggest as a regimen given the potential malignant benefit?

---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No