Reviewer's report

Title: Relevance of cyclin D1b expression and CCND1 polymorphism in the pathogenesis of multiple myeloma and mantle cell lymphoma

Version: 2 Date: 11 July 2006

Reviewer: Jean-Philippe Merlio

Reviewer's report:

The authors have addressed the major and minor comments on their previous manuscript. The study is original and significantly contributes to the understanding of cyclin D1 oncogenic properties in clinical samples of patients with MCL and MM. The revised manuscript is improving the knowledge on MCL and MM pathogenesis by comparison with previous studies.

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

In the Discussion section page 7 second paragraph, it is written that "post-transcriptional mechanisms regulate cyclin D1b status depending on the B-cell hemopathy" whereas in the first paragraph the authors refer to their previous paper showing that "cyclin D1a and b were coexpressed in MCL patients and in MM cell lines irrespectively of the presence of the t(11;14) translocation"

I cannot find in the paper any experimental data ruling out the differential expression of cyclin D1 b according to the mechanism of CCND1 gene activation.

Interestingly all MM cases and cell lines expressed less cyclin D1 b transcripts than MCL cases. Both differential levels of expression and post-transcriptional mechanisms could account for the absence of cyclin D1b protein in MM cases where both a and b transcripts are present. Could the assessment on post-transcriptional regulation "only" be modulated

What next?: Accept after discretionary revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

I have no competing interests'