Reviewer's report

Title: Prognostic significance of composite expressions of MCM2, Ki-67 and gelsolin in non-small cell lung cancer

Version: 3 Date: 10 June 2006

Reviewer: Cheng-long L Huang

Reviewer's report:

General
The revised article demonstrated that only high gelsolin is a significant prognostic factor (Table 2, Table 3) while high MCM2 is likely to be a prognostic factor (Table 3). In addition, Figure 2B clearly demonstrated the composite evaluation using the gelsolin expression and the MCM2 expression to be associated with survivals of NSCLC patients. As a result, authors can emphasize the clinical importance of the gelsolin expression and the MCM2 expression in NSCLC patients. However, the present study did not show any significant association between the Ki-67 expression and survivals of NSCLC patients. In Table 3, the P values are 0.17 and 0.47, respectively. In addition, composite evaluations using the Ki67 expression (Figure 2A and Figure 2C, page 12 line 14 to line 21) are very confusing.

Other revisions are acceptable.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)
Although many previous studies proved the Ki-67 expression to be associated with survivals of NSCLC patients, the present study did not show any significant association between them, as described above. Therefore, authors should simply and shorten these results regarding the Ki67 expression. In addition, these results about the Ki67 expression could be briefly discussed in the paragraph regarding Ki67 (page14).

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)
Regarding 'tumor status' in my previous comment (Major compulsory revision 1), 'Tumor status' is the clinical classification used in TNM stage, based on the primary tumor size and the local invasion of the primary tumor, such as T1, T2, T3, and T4. Because the MCM2 expression and the Ki67 expression are considered to be associated with the tumor proliferation rate, the relationship between them and the tumor size would be informative in Table 2.

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)
None

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.