Reviewer's report

Title: Effects of polymorphisms in ERCC1, ASE-1 and RAI on the risk of colorectal carcinomas and adenomas: a case control study

Version: 1 Date: 10 April 2006

Reviewer: Naoko Ishibe

Reviewer's report:

General

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

(1) Even if functionality is currently unknown, is there any information on what these genes might do?

(2) Were other potential confounders assessed? It is not clear from the submitted manuscript, whether there were any differences by disease status in regards to the information collected (e.g., demographics, diet, smoking habits, etc.). It seems that it may not have been sufficient to adjust only for age and gender. Would suggest adding a table summarizing this by disease status (i.e., cancer, adenomas, control).

(3) More information about the study population seems warranted (e.g., were there exclusion criteria?). Is there a reason why there are so many individuals with adenomas who are included in this study? What were there reasons why only a subset were genotyped (i.e., no blood samples? failure in the assay?)?

(4) Was any sort of QC included for the genotyping?

(5) It seems that if the primary finding is a weak association in women, then this finding needs to explored in greater detail in the discussion section. What are the potential reasons for this finding?

(6) Because these polymorphisms were studied in other cancers rather than colorectal cancer specifically, using references to support this finding seems a bit misleading.

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Reject because scientifically unsound
Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.